

Housing Law, Rights and Policy



Housing Law, Rights and Policy

By

Dr Padraic Kenna

B.A. (Warwick) Ph.D (N.U.I.)



Published by
Clarus Press Ltd,
Griffith Campus,
South Circular Road,
Dublin 8.

Typeset by
Amnet International,
30 Pembroke street,
Dublin 2.

Printed by
CPI Anthony Rowe,
Chippenham,
Wiltshire.

ISBN
Paperback
978-1-905536-37-5

Hardback
978-1905536-36-8

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including recording and photocopying, without the written permission of the copyright holder, application for which should be addressed to the publisher. Written permission should also be obtained before any part of the publication is stored in a retrieval system of any nature.

Disclaimer

Whilst every effort has been made to ensure that the contents of this book are accurate, neither the publisher or authors can accept responsibility for any errors or omissions or loss occasioned to any person acting or refraining from acting as result of any material in this publication.

© Padraic Kenna 2011

This book is dedicated to Anne, Emily and Laura

*This publication was grant-aided by the Publications Fund
of National University of Ireland Galway*

[insert Foreword]



PREFACE

The origins of this book developed from many years working in housing, and more recently in lecturing on my course on housing law and policy at NUI Galway since 2005. A particular aim of this book is to enable all those who are faced with making decisions in the multi-faceted discipline of housing to take a broad, integrated and holistic approach.

Many people have provided assistance with the writing of this book whom I wish to acknowledge: Ciara Hackett, Eddie Lewis, Ciara Murray, Hope Lewis, Lorna Fox, Mark Callanan, PJ Drudy, Eamon O'Shea, Michael Punch, Karen Shally-Lynch, Noelin Fox, Declan Redmond, Eamon Finn, Marc Uhry, Guillem Fernandez, Stefania Del Zotto, Sergio Nasarre-Aznar, Cathal O'Connell, Eoin Quill, Aideen Hayden, Jane Ball, Joanne Campbell, Berna Grist, Bob Jordan, Dáibhí Ó Cróinín, Anne Egan, Joan McCarthy, Freek Spinnewin, Daithi Downey, David Silke, Donal McManus, Gerry Whyte, Ciara Smyth, Donncha O'Connell, Eoin O'Sullivan, Neil Maddox, Joe Finnerty, Eddie Madden, Eilis Barry, Paddy Fay, Kevin Heanue, Elaine Donnelly, Frank Donohue, Des McGreal, Frank Murphy, Gene Clayton, Gerard Quinn, Karen Murphy, Marie McGonagle, Paul Anderson, Paul Joyce, Sean Murphy and many others. While I received much valued advice and assistance, the responsibility for errors and omissions, of course, remains with the author.

A particular thanks to Orla Crowe BCL who carried out research on many of the issues addressed here.

NUI Galway provided Sabbatical Leave in 2009 which enabled me to undertake the major part of the research for this publication.

Special thanks are due to Anne Dolan for her forbearance during the two plus years of my time spent writing this book.

Dr. Padraic Kenna
Galway, March 2011

CONTENTS

Foreword.....	vii
Preface.....	ix
Table of Cases.....	xxv
Table of Legislation.....	xli
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Chapter 2: Outline of the Development of the Irish Housing System.....	13
Chapter 3: Perspectives on the Irish Housing System.....	57
Chapter 4: Housing Need	191
Chapter 5: Particular Housing Needs	237
Chapter 6: Housing and Irish State Finance	345
Chapter 7: Mortgages	431
Chapter 8: Housing Rights.....	509
Chapter 9: Private Law and Housing	613
Chapter 10: Outline of Planning, Housing Standards and Building Regulations.....	689
Chapter 11: Local Authority Housing	731
Chapter 12: Private Rented Housing	841
Chapter 13: Apartments, Multi-Unit Developments and Estates	913
Chapter 14: Housing Associations and Co-operatives	959
Chapter 15: Rural Housing.....	987
Chapter 16: European Union.....	1011
Chapter 17: Conclusion	1053
Bibliography	xxxx
Index.....	xxxx



TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword	vii
Preface	ix
Table of Cases	xxv
Table of Legislation	xli
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Introduction.....	1
The Irish Housing System.....	3
Content of this Book.....	11
Chapter 2: Outline of the Development of the Irish Housing System	13
Introduction.....	13
Early Irish Housing.....	13
Poor Law.....	18
Industrial Revolution.....	20
Philanthropic Approaches in the Late 19th Century.....	22
Rural Ireland.....	25
The Land Commission.....	27
Housing and Labour.....	33
Post Independence.....	35
Post War and Keynes.....	40
The 1960s and 1970s.....	45
The New Land Question.....	49
The Excluded.....	51
Conclusion.....	53
Chapter 3: Perspectives on the Irish Housing System	57
Introduction.....	57
Classical (and Neo-Classical) Economics.....	58
Classical Economics.....	58
Commodification of Housing.....	59
The Housing Market.....	60
Supply and Demand.....	61
House Prices.....	66
House Price Statistics.....	68
Consumer Price Index and House Prices.....	71
Rationale for Intervention in Housing Markets.....	74
Forms of Intervention.....	77
The Enabling Market System.....	81
Weaknesses of the Neo-Classical Approach.....	84
Nationalist Irish Property Ownership Perspectives.....	85
All-Party Oireachtas Committee on the Constitution – Ninth Progress Report - Private Property (2004).....	88

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Marxist Perspectives	90
Engels – “The Housing Question”	91
Other Marxist Approaches	97
The Pathways Approach	99
Defining the Pathways Approach.....	100
Pathways Approach and Homelessness	102
Pathways Approach and Policy Making.....	105
The Concept of Home.....	107
The Irish Constitution and Home.....	112
Home and Housing Policy	113
Home as a Human Rights Concept.....	117
Housing and Home as a Lifestyle Choice.....	119
Social Justice Perspectives.....	120
Utilitarian Justice and Distributive Justice.....	122
Distributive Justice.....	123
Social Justice in Feudal, Market and Organised Capitalist Societies.....	125
Marxism and Social Justice	127
Competing Concepts of Social Justice in Market Societies	129
Social Justice and Wealth.....	132
Social Justice and the Capabilities Approach.....	134
Bunreacht na hÉireann and Social Justice	136
Roman Catholic Perspectives on Social Justice.....	143
The Irish Housing System by the Jesuit Centre for Faith and Justice.....	144
Social Justice Ireland	148
Housing Rights Approach.....	150
Social Partnership and NESC “Vision of Society”	151
Social Partnership	151
Housing and Social Partnership Agreements.....	154
National Economic and Social Council (NESC)	156
The NESC Report—Housing in Ireland: Performance and Policy (2004).....	157
The Developmental Welfare State	161
Towards 2016	165
The Housing Forum	169
Delivering Homes—Sustaining Communities (2007)	170
The NESC Report in 2009, Ireland’s Five-Part Crisis: An Integrated National Response.....	177
The NESC Vision and Well-Being	178
The Approach of Irish Law	179
Communitarianism or Libertartarianism.....	185
Conclusion	189
Chapter 4: Housing Need	191
Introduction.....	191
Housing Need.....	191
Three Approaches to Housing Need	192
Who Decides on Needs?	196

TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Irish Position on Housing Needs	197
ESRI Report on Housing Need	197
Housing with Care and Support	198
NESC and Housing Need.....	200
The Legislative Definitions	202
Assessment for Social Housing Support	206
Homelessness.....	209
Disability and Housing Need	213
European Union and ETHOS Assessment Methods.....	215
CSO Survey on Income and Living Conditions (SILC)	217
Needs and Rights	221
Minimum Core Obligations	224
Progressive Realisation	233
Conclusion	235
Chapter 5: Particular Housing Needs	237
Introduction.....	237
Older People.....	238
A Growing Population	238
Housing for Older People	240
Social Partnership and Rights	242
Nursing Homes	247
Sheltered Housing.....	250
HIQA and Older People.....	255
The “Fair Deal” or Nursing Homes Support Scheme.....	259
Co-housing.....	261
Conclusion	262
Homeless People.....	262
Background.....	262
Housing Act 1988	264
Homelessness Strategies	266
Rights	269
The Way Home (2008).....	270
The Homeless Agency	274
Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) 2009—Homelessness Action Plans.....	275
People with Disabilities	280
A Large Number of People.....	280
Shift to Rights-Based Approach	285
A Paradigm Shift Away from Charity.....	286
The Independent Living Concept.....	289
International Disability Rights.....	295
The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and European Disability Rights.....	296
European Union.....	299
Council of Europe.....	300
The Disability Databases	307
National Intellectual Disability Database (NIDD).....	308
National Physical and Sensory Disability Database (NPSDD)	313

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Building for Everyone – Design	314
Mental Health and Housing Need.....	317
The Mental Health Commission Reports.....	321
Amnesty International and Mental Health.....	324
The National Disability Authority	324
Disabled Persons Grant.....	325
Disability Act 2005 and Sectoral Plans	326
Capacity and People with Disabilities	328
Health Information and Quality Authority (HIQA) National Quality Standards: Residential Services for People with Disabilities	330
Refugees, Asylum-Seekers and Migrant Workers	334
Refugees and Migrants	341
Conclusion	343
Chapter 6: Housing and Irish State Finance.....	345
Introduction.....	345
Calculating Expenditure on Housing	345
Housing as a Proportion of Fixed Capital Formation	347
State Housing Expenditure in Ireland	348
Direct Capital Expenditure on Housing	349
State Subsidies for Homeownership	353
Problems of Affordability	353
House Prices and Average Industrial Earnings	354
Subsidies and Support for Homeownership.....	356
Local Authority Sales to Tenants.....	358
Housing Finance Agency.....	360
Shared Ownership.....	363
Mortgage Allowance.....	365
Mortgage Interest Supplement.....	366
Affordable Housing Schemes	370
Local Authority 1999 Affordable Housing Scheme	370
Part V Affordable Housing	371
Affordable Homes Partnership	376
Home Choice Loan Scheme	378
Incremental Purchase Scheme	380
Affordable Dwelling Purchase Arrangements	386
Recovery of Debt and Discharge of Mortgages by Housing Authorities.....	389
Risks of Default on Low Income Home Buyers Schemes.....	390
Taxation and Housing	392
Housing Wealth	392
Taxation of Housing.....	399
Residential Property Tax.....	402
Capital Acquisitions Tax.....	402
Capital Gains Tax.....	404
Stamp Duty	405
Value-Added Tax	406
Windfall Tax on Rezoned Land	406
Mortgage Tax Relief	407

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Tax Relief for Landlords of Residential Properties	409
Rent-a-Room Relief.....	409
Tax Relief for Residential Tenants.....	410
Special Tax Relief Schemes Relating to Housing Development	411
Urban Renewal Scheme	411
Rural Renewal Scheme	413
Resort Renewal Areas Scheme	414
Living Over The Shop Scheme.....	415
Student Accommodation.....	415
The Indecon Report on Property-based Tax Incentive Schemes	417
Tax Relief for Service Charges	419
Commission on Taxation Report 2009	419
The Local Government (Charges) Act 2009.....	426
Conclusion	428
Chapter 7: Mortgages	431
Introduction.....	431
Residential Mortgage Lending.....	431
Extent and Nature of Mortgages.....	431
International Comparison of Mortgage Lending	433
Profile of Borrowers.....	434
Growth in Mortgage Lending	435
Numbers and Size of Mortgage Loans Paid 1990–2008	436
Borrowing from Abroad	437
Rise of Interest Only Loans	438
Growth and Decline of Mortgage Products	439
Proportion of Fixed and Variable Rate Loans.....	440
Repayment and Endowment Mortgages	440
Securitisation of Residential Mortgages.....	441
Mortgage Arrears.....	444
Legal Basis of Mortgages	445
The Legal Concept of a Mortgage	445
The Land and Conveyancing Reform Act 2009 (LCLRA).....	446
Legal Mortgage.....	446
Equitable Mortgage.....	448
Powers and Rights of Mortgagee.....	448
Powers and Rights of the Mortgagor	453
Judgment Mortgages.....	455
Judgment Mortgages and the Family Home	456
Judgment Mortgages and Joint Tenants.....	458
Judgment Mortgages Registered During Transfers	459
Consumer Regulation in Housing Finance	460
Consumer Credit Act 1995	460
Definitions under the CCA 1995	461
A “Housing Loan”	463
Redemption of Housing Loans	466
Annual Percentage Rate (APR) on Housing Loans	466
Valuation Reports, Investigation of Title and Insurance	467
Prohibition on Linking of Services.....	467

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Warnings and Required Documents.....	468
Disclosure of Fees, Interest Rate and Penalties	469
Codes of Conduct in Relation to Home Loans	469
The European Voluntary Code.....	469
Voluntary Codes of the Irish Banking Federation	470
IBF/MABS Operational Protocol	472
IBF ‘Statement of Intent’	472
Financial Services Regulator Consumer Protection Code	473
Consumer Protection Code - Clarifications issued	
by Financial Regulator	477
Statutory Code of Conduct on Mortgage Arrears (2009)	479
Revised Code of Conduct on Mortgage Arrears (2010).....	481
Expert Group on Mortgage Arrears and Personal Debt.....	482
Control of Sub-Prime Lenders.....	484
Human Rights	487
Unfair Terms in Consumer Contract Regulations.....	488
Office of the Financial Services Ombudsman	491
Mortgages and the European Union	491
National Mortgage Markets in Europe	492
Commission Proposals for a European Mortgage Market.....	496
The European Hypothec Proposals.....	499
The Eurohypothec and the Eurotrust	501
Building Societies	501
Conclusion	506
Chapter 8: Housing Rights.....	509
Introduction.....	509
Civil and Political Rights or Socio-Economic Rights.....	510
Dignity as a Basis for Housing Rights.....	514
Housing Rights in International Law	519
UN International Instruments	519
The Nature of the State Obligations on the UN Instruments.....	521
Women’s Housing Rights	529
Other UN Housing Rights Instruments.....	531
Challenges in Transposing UN International	
Public Law Housing Rights	534
Applying Housing Rights at the Micro, Meso and Macro Level.....	543
MACRO Level	544
MESO level – Housing System and Institutions.....	547
Micro – Level.....	549
Transposing UN International Public Law	
Housing Rights to Ireland.....	551
The “NESC Vision” and Approach to Socio-Economic Rights	554
The Council of Europe	560
European Social Charter and Revised Charter.....	561
The European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR).....	564
The European Union (EU).....	566
Housing Rights in National Law	572
Constitutions	572

TABLE OF CONTENTS

National Legislative Provisions 573

The Human Rights Based Approach..... 575

Other Approaches to Housing Rights 581

Consumer, Post-modernist, Critical, Feminist and Other Approaches 583

Housing Rights and Social Movements 585

New Irish State Institutions Advancing Rights in

 Housing Systems in Ireland 586

 The Irish Human Rights Commission 586

The Ombudsman 587

Office of the Ombudsman for Children 589

Freedom of Information 591

Equality and Housing..... 592

Housing Discrimination Sample Cases..... 596

Data Protection..... 604

Legal Aid and Housing 606

Conclusion 611

Chapter 9: Private Law and Housing 613

Housing and Family Law 613

Definition of “Family” 615

Disputes over the “Family Home” 617

Direct and Indirect Contributions 618

Work in the Family Business or Home 619

Cohabitation Agreements..... 620

Estoppel, Rights of Residence and Co-ownership 621

Family Law Legislation 623

“Consent” under the Act of 1976..... 624

Conveyance under the Act of 1976..... 627

Judicial Separation and Family Law Reform Act 1989 628

The Family Law Act 1995 629

Family Law (Divorce) Act 1996..... 629

The Civil Partnership and Certain Rights and Obligations of

 Cohabitants Act 2010..... 633

Civil Partnership 634

Cohabitees..... 636

Domestic Violence..... 638

Property Registration and Exchange Systems 641

 The Land Registration System..... 641

Registration of Deeds..... 641

Registration of Title 642

Doctrine of Notice..... 644

Overview of Conveyancing..... 646

Reform of the Conveyancing Process 648

Consumer Protection..... 653

 Housing Consumers..... 654

New Approaches to Consumer Law and Housing..... 655

Unfair Contract Terms in Consumer Contracts..... 660

Contracts for New Homes..... 662

Rented Housing..... 665

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Other Related Issues	667
Purchasers' Protection for New Homes	668
Auctioneers and Estate Agents	677
Professional Building Services	681
Succession	683
Ground Rents Legislation	685
Conclusion	687
Chapter 10: Outline of Planning, Housing Standards and Building Regulations	689
Introduction	689
Outline of Planning and Housing Issues	690
Planning Permission and Enforcement	701
Contributions to Residential Infrastructure Costs by Housing Developers	705
New Approaches to the Infrastructure Regime	706
Public Health and Nuisance	709
Noise Nuisance	710
Control of Poor Housing	712
Building Regulations	714
Building Control	716
Water Supply	722
Sewage and Waste	724
The Residential Infrastructure Regime is not Consumer Oriented	725
Conclusion	729
Chapter 11: Local Authority Housing	731
Introduction	731
Overview of Local Authority Housing	732
Local Authority Housing Law	734
Housing Functions of Local Authorities	735
Overcrowded and Unfit Houses	740
Acquisition of Land	742
Provision of Sites for Building Houses	743
Provision of Dwellings	744
Allocation and Letting of Local Authority Housing	746
Allocation of Affordable Housing	753
Standards for Local Authority Housing	753
Regulations on Standards	756
Management of Local Authority Housing	759
Housing Services Plan	763
Delegation of Housing Functions	765
Local Authority Rents	766
Rent Book Regulations	768
Recovery of Possession of Dwellings and Other Buildings	769
Influence of the ECHR Act 2003	772
Illegal Occupiers of Local Authority Housing	784
Anti-Social Behaviour	784
Excluding Orders	786
Restrictions on Lettings	789
Anti-Social Behaviour Strategies	789

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Other Approaches to Anti-social Behaviour	791
Housing Management Approaches – A Contested Arena	797
Disposal/Sale of Housing by Local Authorities.....	803
Tenant Purchase of Apartments	805
The Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1979	807
The Housing Act 1988	808
The Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1992	810
Local Authority Housing and the Traveller Community	812
Housing and the Traveller Community.....	816
Housing (Traveller Accommodation) Act 1998.....	818
Emergency Situations	820
Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002 and Travellers.....	825
Prohibition of Incitement of Hatred Act 1989 and Ethnicity.....	825
Traveller Accomodation and the ECHR Act 2003.....	826
Planning and Development Act 2000	828
Local Government Act 2001	834
Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2002.....	834
Planning and Development (Amendment) Act 2002.....	835
Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act, 2004.....	835
Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2009.....	836
Conclusion	838
Chapter 12: Private Rented Housing	841
Introduction.....	841
Background.....	842
The Genesis of Landlord and Tenant Law	844
Protection of Property Rights.....	845
Corporate Property Rights	848
Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1992.....	849
Rent Book Regulations	850
Standards in Rented Housing.....	854
The Housing (Standards for Rented Houses) Regulations 2008.....	854
Enforcement.....	863
The Report of the Commission on the Private Rented Residential Sector	863
Residential Tenancies Act 2004.....	868
Definitions of Tenancy, Dwelling and other matters.....	869
Obligations of Landlord and Tenant	871
Rent Setting and Reviews	878
Security of Tenure	879
Dispute Resolution	882
Registration of Rented Houses.....	883
Reports of the PRTB and Significant Cases.....	885
Supplementary Rent Allowance and Rent Supplement	888
Entitlement to Rent Supplement	890
Appeals	894
Restrictions in Areas of Regeneration for the Purpose of Providing for Greater Social Integration	897
Habitual Residency	898
Anti-Social Behaviour and Eligibility.....	899

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Recipients and Expenditure on Rent Supplement.....	900
Reform of the Rent Supplement Scheme.....	901
Rental Accommodation Scheme and Chapter 4 Tenancies	903
Investment Buy-to-Let	909
Conclusion	910
Chapter 13: Apartments, Multi-Unit Developments and Estates	913
Introduction.....	913
Apartments and Multi-Unit Developments.....	913
The Multi-Unit Developments Bill 2009	928
Local Authority Apartments	936
Housing (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 2009.....	936
Housing Estates.....	941
Law Reform Commission Recommendations	942
Legislation in Relation to Taking in Charge	945
Framework for a Comprehensive Taking in Charge Policy	949
Mixed Tenure Developments and Estates	954
Conclusion	958
Chapter 14: Housing Associations and Co-operatives	959
Introduction.....	959
NESC and Other Reports	960
State Assistance to Approved Bodies	962
Capital Funding Schemes	967
Capital Assistance Scheme	970
The Capital Loan and Rental Subsidy Scheme.....	971
Housing Co-operatives.....	972
Housing Association Tenancies	974
European Convention on Human Rights.....	978
Unfair Terms in Consumer Contracts Regulations	980
Rent Supplement.....	984
Incremental Purchase Scheme	984
Conclusion	985
Chapter 15: Rural Housing.....	987
Introduction.....	987
Historical Perspectives	987
Housing and Farm Labourers.....	989
The Rural Idyll.....	990
Farming	993
The Growth of Rural Suburbs and Urban Sprawl.....	995
Guidelines for Planning Authorities for Sustainable Rural Housing	998
Ghost Estates.....	1002
Holiday Homes	1002
One-Off Housing.....	1005
Poor Housing and Homelessness	1007
Conclusion	1009
Chapter 16: European Union.....	1011
Introduction.....	1011
Housing in the Europe Union	1012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Outline of Housing Policy in the EU 1016
Freedom of Movement and Right of Establishment 1022
European Land Registration Systems 1024
EULIS 1025
Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union 1026
Consumer Protection..... 1032
EU Social Inclusion Policies..... 1033
EU Strategy on Social Protection and Social Inclusion..... 1035
Equality and Non-Discrimination 1039
Social Housing and EU State Aid Rules 1040
Construction Products 1050
Environmental and Energy Policy..... 1050
Conclusion 1051
Chapter 17: Conclusion 1053
Law, Rights and Policy—Legislature, Judiciary and Executive 1054
Legislation..... 1056
Rights 1057
The Courts..... 1058
The Executive..... 1060
The Dilemma of Law and Policy 1062
Policy as a Governance Construct..... 1064
Policy as an Emanation of Statute 1067
The Implementation Deficit 1068
The Legacy..... 1071
Bibliography 1073
Index..... 1111